# FEB 3 2003 LARRY W. PROPES, CLERK CHARLESTON, SC

## IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF SOUTH CAROLINA CHARLESTON DIVISION

Case No. 2-02-1915-18

DAVID D. BENNETT,	)	
PLAINTIFF,	) ) )	
VS.	) I	MOTION TO QUASH
BIO-REFERENCE LABORATORIES, INC.,	) ) )	
DEFENDANT.	) ) )	

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that, pursuant to Rule 45 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, the Defendant above-named, by and through its undersigned counsel, hereby moves this Honorable Court to quash the subpoena addressed to Rebecca Klafter, dated January 30, 2003. A copy of said subpoena, and the Order of the Honorable David C. Norton attached thereto, are attached to this motion as Exhibit "A."

As grounds for this motion, Defendant would show the Court as follows:

- 1. Counsel for Defendant had no notice of the motion which resulted in Judge Norton's Order of January 30, 2003, relating to service of a subpoena on Ms. Klafter, requiring her attendance at the arbitration of this matter on February 4, 2003, at 2:00 p.m.
- 2. Service of a copy of the subpoena and Judge Norton's Order upon counsel for the Defendant was improper, in that the documents were faxed to defense counsel at 5:11 p.m. on Friday, January 31, 2003, and defense counsel did not see the documents until Monday morning, February 3, 2003.

3. Counsel for the Defendant has spoken with Daniel M. Dwyer, Ms. Klafter's attorney in New Jersey, and he denies requesting that a subpoena be issued from the Federal District Court where Ms. Klafter lives, as stated in the third paragraph of Judge Norton's Order.

WHEREFORE, the Defendant moves this Honorable Court for an Order quashing the subpoena issued to Rebecca Klafter by counsel for the Plaintiff, dated January 30, 2003, and for such other relief the Court may deem just and proper.

Respectfully submitted,

Showard which

Thomas S. White (Fed. ID #6510) Haynsworth Sinkler & Boyd 160 East Bay Street Post Office Box 340 Charleston, SC 29402

Phone: (843) 722-3366 Fax: (843) 722-2266

ATTORNEYS FOR THE DEFENDANT

Charleston, South Carolina

February 3, 2003

AO 88 (Rev. 1/54) Subpoena in a Civil Case

# **United States District Court** Eastern District of New York

DAVID D. BENNEIT, PLAINTIPP V.	SUBPOENA IN A CIVIL CASE
BIO-REFERENCE LANGRATORIES, INC., DEFENDANT	CASE NUMBER: 2:02-1915-18
REBECCA KLAFTER 10: 102 BRISTCL DRIVE WOODBURY, NY 11797	and the second second second second below to
YOU ARE COMMANDED to appear in the United estify in the above case.	d States District Court at the place, date, and time specified below to
MCCARTER & ENGLISH, L.L.P.	COURTROOM R/A
POUR CATERAY CENTER 100 MULHERRY STREET NEWARK, NI 07101-0652	TUESDAY, FERRUARY 4, 2003 AT 2:00 p.m.
YOU ARE COMMANDED to produce and permit blace, date, and time specified below (list documents or o	inspection and copying of the following documents or objects at the bjects):
PLACE	OATE AND TIME
YOU ARE COMMANDED to permit inspection o	f the following premises at the date and time specified below.  DATE AND TIME
Any organization not a party to this suit that in officers, directors, or managing agents, or other persons designated the managers on which the person will restify.	
ISSUING OFFICER SIGNATURE AND TITLE (INDICATE IF ATTORNEY  LOCAL GOOD CONTROL OF THE SIGNATURE AND PHONE NUMBER	toway for Plaintiff 1/30/03
	The of Clint Promoting Street C & Click Next Page)

88 (Rev 1/94) Subpoens in a Civil Case	
	PROOF OF SERVICE
DATE	PLACE
RVED	
RVED ON (PRINT NAME)	MANNER OF SERVICE
KACD ON GOLD	
RVED BY (PRINT NAME)	TITLE
DF	ECLARATION OF SERVER
I declar under penalty of periury under the l	laws of the United States of America that the foregoing information
1 and are that possess of page 1	
00 DATE	SIGNATURE OF SERVER
DAIE	
	ADDRESS OF SERVER

# Rule 45, Federel Rules of Civil Procedure, Parts C & D

## (c) PROTECTION OF PERSONS SUBJECT TO SUBPOENAS.

- () ) A party or an atturney for the incurred and server of a subposte theil mice reasonable steps to avoid imposing undue burden or expense on a person subject to that subposts. The court on behalf of which the subposts was issued shall enforce side duty and impose upon the party or attorney in breach of this duty an appropriate senction which may include, but is not limited to, lost sarrings and consonable anomey's fee
- (2) (A) A person commended to produce and person inspection and copying of designated books, papers, documents or rangible things, or inspection of premiers road sot appear to person at the place of production or inspection unless commended to appear for deposition, hearing or trial.
- (6) Subject to paragraph (d) (3) of saic rate, a person commanded to produce and permit inspection and copying may, within 13 days after privice of subports to before the time spectated for compliance if such time is less than 14 days after service, serve upon the party or succities designated in the subports written opinion to inspection or copying of any or all of the designated materials or of the pramises. If objection is made, the party serving the subports shall not be entitled to inspect and copy materials or inspect the premises except purchase to an order of the court by which the subports were immed. If objection had been made, the name (B) Subject to paragraph (d) (3) of this rate, a parace which the subports was issued. If objection has been made, the party which the subports was issued. If objection has been made, the party serving the subports may, upon notice to the person commended to produce, move as any time for an order to compal the production. Such an order to compel production shall protect my person who is not a party or an officer of a party from elimificant expense resulting
- (3) (A) On timely storion, the court by which a subposes was issued shall quest of modify the subposes if it
- (i) talls to allow reasonable time for complished (ii) requires a person who is not a purity or an officer of a party to cavel to a place more than 100 miles from the place where that (i) have in allow remained to regularly transacts business in

person, succept that, subject to the provisions of clause (c)(X)(E)(ii) of this rule, such a person may in order to attend trial be communated to trial from any such place within the state in which the trial is held, of (iii) requires disalosant of privileged or other protected trainer and no exception or waiver applies, or

(IV) subjects a person to undue hurden.

#### (B) if a suppose

(i) requires disclosure of a trade secret or other confidential

(i) requires discionate of a usua sector of outer contration of information for descriping specific events or occurrences in dispute information for descriping specific events or occurrences in dispute information for descriping specific events or occurrences in dispute information for the requirement in the requirement of any sector of outer candidates of any

- (iii) requires a parson who is not a party or an officer of a party to incur substantial expense to never more than 100 miles to accord trial. The court may, to protect a person subject to or affected by the subposses, quasis or modify the subposses, or, if the party in whose boball the subposses is issued shows a substantial need for the testimenty or material that campot be otherwise fact without undue testimenty or material that campot be otherwise fact without undue hardship and assures that the person to whom the subposes is addressed will be restoughly compensated, the court may order appearance or production only upon specified conditions
  (d) DUTIES IN RESPONDING TO SUBPOENA:
- (1) A person responding to a subposes to produce documents shall produce them 44 they are kept at the usual course of husiness or shall organize and label them to correspond with the categories in the demand
- (2) When information subject to a subjecture is withheld on a claim that it is privileged or subject to protection as that preparation materials, the claim shall be made expressly and shall be supported by a description of the patter of the documents, communications, or things sat produced that is sufficient to crable the demanding party to consider the claim. CONTAST DIC CHEIRL

FILED

2003 0 8 MAL

# LARRY W. PROPER, CLERK CHARLESTON, 8C

#### IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF SOUTH CAROLINA CHARLESTON DIVISION

DAVID D. BENNETT,	)	C.A. NO. 2:02-1915-18
PLAINTIFF.	) }	
Vs.	\ \	ORDER
BIO-REPERENCE LABORATORIES. INC.,	}	
DEFENDANT.	) )	

WHEREAS, this case was stayed pending arbitration by Order of this Court on July 23, 2002, and

WHEREAS, it appears that an essential witness for the Plaintiff is Rebecca Klafter who has been previously subported by Plaintiff to appear at the arbitration, and

WHEREAS, it appears Ms. Klafter's attorney in New Jersey has requested that a Subpoens be issued from the Federal District Court where Ms. Klather lives,

NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS ORDERED, pursuant to Rule 45 of the Pederal Rules of Civil Procedure, that the Federal District Court in the Eastern District of New York honor the Subpoens issued in the District of South Carolina for the above-referenced matter by issuing a Supboena for Ms. Rebecca Klafter's attendance at an arbitration to be held in this matter at McCarter and English law offices on February 4, 2003 at 2:00 p.m. It is further Ordered that Plaintiff make arrangements to have the Subpoens personally served on Ms. Klafter.

AND IT IS SO ORDERED!

The Honorable David C. Norton United Stand District Court District of South Carolina Charleston Division

Charleston, South Carolina

Date:

## IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF SOUTH CAROLINA CHARLESTON DIVISION

Case No. 2-02-1915-18

STATE OF SOUTH CAROLINA	)
COUNTY OF CHARLESTON	)
DAVID D. BENNETT,	)
PLAINTIFF,	) <u>CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE</u>
vs.	)
BIO-REFERENCE LABORATORIES, INC.,	) ) )
DEFENDANT.	) ) )

The undersigned employee of Haynsworth Sinkler Boyd, P.A., hereby certifies that I have on this 3rd day of February, 2003, served a true and correct copy of the above and foregoing *Motion to Quash*, VIA HAND DELIVERY, upon the following counsel for the Plaintiff:

Sources Douces

Nancy Bloodgood YOUNG, CLEMENT, RIVERS & TISDALE, LLP 28 Broad Street Charleston, SC 29402